



Staff Report

Agent		Staff Recommendation
Applicant	Eduardo Gonzalez del Real and Lorinda Stuit	APPROVAL of Case # 09LUCC-50040, Project #1000680, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, based on Findings 1-13 beginning on page 10 and subject to Conditions beginning on page 11.
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness	
Legal Description	Lot 8 Block 18 Huning Highland Addition	
Address/Location	408 Edith Blvd. SE	
Size		
Zoning	SU-2/MR	Maryellen Hennessy
Historic Location	Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone	Staff Planner

Summary of Analysis

A second element of the alteration is to retain a portion of the existing shed roofed addition and remodel it by retaining and raising the existing north and east walls and adding a new hipped roof and clerestory windows.

The gabled roofed addition that is proposed is substantially in compliance with the development guidelines for the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone. The hipped roof portion of the proposal is not compatible with the existing house in its massing. This element should be modified to include another intersecting gable roof.

If the recommended modifications to the design were made, the historic architectural character of 408 Edith SE would be sufficiently preserved to meet applicable guidelines.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone.

City Departments and other interested agencies were given the opportunity to review this application from 9/17/09 to 10/05/09. Agency comments that were received were used in the preparation of this report, and begin on page 12.

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

Requests	Certificate of appropriateness for alteration
Historic Location	Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	# of Stories	Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction	Historic Classification & Land Use
General Area	1-2	Hipped and gabled pitch, flat; Queen Anne, Free Classic Queen Anne, Italianate, Bungalow, NM and SW Vernacular, Spanish-Pueblo Revival; 1880-1920s.	Contributing; Non-contributing; residential
Site to the North	1	Gabled; Simplified Queen Anne; 1892	Contributing; residential
Sites to the South	2	Gabled; Stick style; 1892	Contributing; residential
Sites to the East	1	Hipped; Hipped Box; 1908	Contributing; residential
Site to the West	1	Gabled; National Folk; 1905	Contributing; residential

Background

The subject house is a one story brick bungalow with Craftsman detailing built in 1921. The gabled roof has wood shingles, exposed rafter tails and knee braces at the eaves. The windows on the house are primarily four over one double-hung wood windows with concrete sills and lintils. The gable ends are finished with wood shingles, and the front porch gable end has vertical wood trim in the gable end on the front porch.

A shed-roofed addition of approximately 300 square feet at the rear has wood siding. Sanborn Fire Insurance maps indicate that this rear addition was built between 1931 and 1942, and it is typical of shed roofed rear additions on Albuquerque's historic houses. It is frame construction, has a low shed roof, minimal foundation and little to no insulation. The applicant proposes to remove this structure and construct a new addition in its place, with an intersecting gable roof, adding another 300 square feet to the house.

A portion of the existing structure will be left in place on the north end, and they propose to alter this existing section by raising the roof structure and adding a hipped roof and clerestory windows to this portion.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

Albuquerque-Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan of 1988, amended 2003

This site is a Historic Resource in terms used in the *Comprehensive Plan*. The plan sets out goals and policies concerning land use, environmental protection and heritage conservation. Chapter II, Section 5, Historic Resources Goals and Policies (pp. II-61-II-62) states:

“The Goal for Historic Resources is to protect, reuse or enhance significant historic buildings and districts.”

Applicable Historic Resources policies include:

Policy a: Efforts to provide incentives for the protection of significant buildings and districts shall be continued and expanded.

Policy b: Research, evaluation, and protection of historical and cultural properties in the City and County shall be continued where appropriate.

Policy c: Increase public and inter-agency awareness of historic resources and preservation

This site is contained in the Central Urban Development Area, a portion of the Established Urban Development Area as defined in the *Comprehensive Plan*, and is subject to the policies of Section II.B.5 (Established Urban Area) as well as the Central Urban Area policies. The Goal of the Central Urban Area is to “promote the Central Urban Area as a focus for arts, cultural, and public facilities/activities while recognizing and enhancing the character of its residential neighborhoods and its importance as the historic center of the City.”

The Goal of the Established Urban Area is to “create a quality urban environment which perpetuates the tradition of identifiable, individual, but integrated communities within the metropolitan area and which offers variety and maximum choice in housing, transportation, work areas, and life styles, while creating a visually pleasing built environment.”

Applicable Established Urban Area policies include:

Policy d: “The location, intensity, and design of new development shall respect existing neighborhood values, natural environmental conditions and carrying capacities, scenic resources, and resources of other social, cultural, and recreational concern.”

Policy o: “Redevelopment and rehabilitation of older neighborhoods in the Established Urban Area shall be continued and strengthened.”

Huning Highland Sector Development Plan

The Huning Highland Sector Development Plan was first adopted in 1977, and revised in 1988. The Plan generally encompasses properties between Martin Luther King Boulevard

and Coal Avenue and Broadway Boulevard and Locust Avenue; specific boundaries are shown on Map 2 on page 4 in the Plan. It sets forth goals and policies regarding land use:

The Goal of the Plan is "the continued development of Huning Highlands into a viable residential and commercial area, building on its unique historic character and location." Plan objectives include, as related to this proposal:

1. To protect and enhance the unique residential character of the area.
2. To encourage appropriate neighborhood-oriented use of vacant lands and buildings.
3. To represent fairly all interests in the Huning Highland Sector Plan area.

Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone Design Guidelines

The subject site is contained within the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone. The Huning Highland Historic District (SR # 464) was listed on the State of New Mexico Register of Cultural Properties on August 27, 1976 and was listed on the National Register of Historic Places on December 9, 1978. The Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone was adopted by the Council and established under Resolution (R-117-1980) on June 2, 1980. The Resolution also approved the Design Guidelines. The design guidelines were revised and included in the 1988 *Huning Highland Sector Development Plan*. The Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone protects the historic and architectural characteristics of the individual buildings. The Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission (LUCC) retains jurisdiction over the exterior appearance of the buildings within the Historic Overlay Zone, both contributing and non-contributing buildings, residential and non-residential. The design guidelines are administered by the LUCC, and include direction on such issues as building height, massing, proportion and scale, use of materials in new and existing buildings, relationship between buildings, landscaping, roadways, sidewalks, etc.

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a contributing property in the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

"Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city's economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city's heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."

ANALYSIS

Huning Highlands Development Guidelines

The table below provides an evaluation of the submittal as it relates to pertinent aspects of the Huning Highland Guidelines as amended through 1998.

Section III. (Guidelines)	Analysis	Does the application satisfy the criteria?
A. Overall General Guidelines Any alteration or new construction in the district shall:		
1. Maintain the over-all relationship of any one building's height, mass and scale to those of other buildings on the block;	The new gabled roof addition is well integrated to the existing house and the height, mass and scale are similar to existing. The hipped roof portion of the alteration has a different massing than other buildings on the block.	YES and NO
2. Maintain the pattern created by the building fronts and setback from the street;	Building front and setback are not affected by the proposed alteration.	YES
3. Maintain the geometry created by similar shapes and sizes; i.e. pitched roofs and porches;	The new gabled roof addition is well integrated to the existing house and the shape and size harmonize with the district. The hipped roof portion of the alteration introduces a different shape.	YES and NO
4. Emphasize, protect and enhance existing streetscape components;	Streetscape components are not affected by the proposed alteration	YES
5. Protect the integrity of existing significant and contributing buildings;	The architectural integrity of the existing contribution building is maintained except for the unusual shape of the hipped roof portion.	YES and NO
6. Use exposed materials compatible with historic construction in the district as follows:		
a. If new construction, all materials shall be compatible with materials used on adjacent buildings; if an already existing buildings, all materials shall be compatible with material used on that structure;	The exterior materials proposed for the new addition include wood shingles in the gable end, wood windows, stucco or brick veneer on the new construction, and maintaining existing horizontal wood siding on a portion of the new work. All of these materials are compatible with the existing building. Stucco might be preferable to the brick veneer, as it will help to distinguish the new work from the historic house.	YES
b. The use of wood, brick, stone and adobe is recommended;	Wood, brick and stucco finish are proposed.	YES
c. The use of asphalt shingles for roofs is acceptable;	Asphalt shingles are proposed.	YES
d. Original material should not be	None proposed	

covered by stucco or metal siding;		
e. The use of plastic, metal, and other unsympathetic materials is discouraged.	None proposed	YES
B. Rehabilitation/Renovation or Alteration of Existing Residential Structures		
1. Buildings listed in the Huning Highland National District on the National Register of Historic Places as Significant or Contributing shall:		
a. Preserve unusual and irreplaceable architectural details; b. Keep original materials (i.e. wood, brick) whenever possible; c. Avoid the use of inappropriate materials (i.e., plastic, metal); d. Not necessarily attempt literal duplication of historic architectural styles in additions to existing structures; e. Keep original door, window, and roof shapes and arrangements; use of wooden window elements is encouraged; if metal frames must be used, a shiny metallic appearance must be avoided;	No unusual or irreplaceable architectural details are affected by the proposal. A portion of the new work retains the existing wood siding. No inappropriate materials are proposed. The new gabled roof addition reflects the intersecting gable front porch on the existing structure. This provides for a harmonious and integrated addition to the building. The wood shingles in the gable end duplicate the front porch detail. Choosing an exterior wall finish other than brick veneer (such as stucco or wood siding) will help to distinguish the new work from the historic house. The roof, doors and windows of the main (brick) historic structure are not affected by the proposal. The rear porch addition will be removed. New wood windows are proposed for the new work.	YES
2. Additions to these buildings shall be: a. Oriented to the alley, or set-back from the front façade, if placed on the side; b. Related to the rest of the building in scale, mass, and shape; c. Appropriate in material and color; d. Compatible with the original structure in window design; e. Compatible with the original structure in terms of roof slope and shape.	The addition is to be located at the rear of the house, well set back from the front façade. Except for the hipped roof portion of the new work, it relates to the existing building in scale, mass and shape. It is subordinate to the main structure and the intersecting gable reflects the front intersecting gable. Materials and window design are compatible with the original structure. The portion of the new work that includes the hip roof does not appear compatible with the original structure and introduces a fundamentally different and somewhat incongruous element. It does not relate to the rest of the building in scale, mass and shape. This element will be visible from the street on the north.	YES and NO

3. Outbuildings		
4. Non-contributing Buildings:		
C. Rehab/Renovation or Alterations of Existing Commercial Structures		
D. Guidelines for New Construction		
E. Streetscape		
F. Security		
G. Efficient Energy Use		

LUC Ordinance

The table below provides an evaluation of the submittal as it relates to the LUC Ordinance and the specific development guidelines as analyzed above.

LUC Ordinance (§14-12) Guidelines for New Construction	Analysis	Does the application satisfy the ordinance criteria?
§14-12-8-B- (1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone	The proposed alterations are consistent with the development guidelines with the exception of one portion of the new work. That can be addressed by changing the roof shape on that portion of the work.	YES and NO
§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished	The contributing building is a one story brick bungalow built in 1921. A front facing gable has wood shingles do the gable ends on the main roof. The removal of the shed-roofed addition at the rear does not diminish the architectural character of the structure significantly. The proposed new work is well integrated and subordinate to the main structure, with slight modification.	YES and NO
§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a "certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976	Not applicable to this application	
§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site's distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.	The contributing building is a one story brick bungalow built in 1921. Evidence indicates that the shed-roofed addition at the rear was built 1931-1942. The method of construction differs from the main house and is of inferior quality. The removal of the shed-roofed addition at the rear does not diminish the	YES

	architectural character of the structure significantly.	
§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design;	The shed-roofed rear addition to this brick bungalow is not a prominent feature of the house, nor is it characteristic of the bungalow style. These rear additions were typical, inexpensive solutions to adding utilitarian space to almost all styles of houses in the early twentieth century. They typically have low roofs, poor or no insulation and foundations.	YES
§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located	The proposed gable roofed addition incorporates roof shapes, exterior materials and window patterns that reflect the existing building and the neighborhood. It would not readily be described as a "contemporary" design. The hipped roof portion of the proposed work has a contemporary appearance, but does not appear compatible with the existing building or the neighborhood.	YES and NO
§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted.	Not applicable to this application	

Additional Considerations

The Huning Highland Neighborhood Association and the Broadway Central Corridors Partnership, Inc. were notified of this application. No comment has been received as of the production of this report.

Conclusion

The proposed addition and alteration is substantially in compliance with the development guidelines for the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone. The rear porch addition that is to be removed was constructed sometime between 1931 and 1942. It is typical of shed roofed rear additions on Albuquerque's historic houses. It is of frame construction, has a low roof, minimal foundation and little to no insulation. The shed-roofed rear addition to this brick bungalow is not a prominent feature of the house, nor is it characteristic of the bungalow style. These rear additions were typical, inexpensive solutions to adding utilitarian space to almost all styles of houses in the early twentieth century in Albuquerque.

The proposed gabled roof addition is well integrated to the existing house and is subordinate in its mass and scale. Proposed materials are compatible with the existing house.

The portion of the existing structure that is to be re-used, however, is less harmonious with the existing bungalow. With its small, hipped roof and clerestory windows, it introduces a disparate element to the otherwise harmonious composition. This element should be reconsidered, and would be more harmonious if another intersecting gable roof was used. If more light in the new space, flush mounted skylights could be used on the new roof

FINDINGS for a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration - Case #09LUCC-50040 / Project # 1000680 (October 14, 2009)

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration at 408 Edith SE, described as Lot 8, Block 18 of the Huning Highland Addition, in the Huning Highland Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/ MR.
2. The subject site is a Contributing property in the Huning Highland Historic District.
3. The subject house is a one-story brick Bungalow with Craftsman detail built in 1921. A rear addition of frame construction was added sometime between 1931 and 1942.
4. The proposal is to remove the majority of the frame rear addition and construct a new addition in its place. The new addition will have an intersecting gable roof and will add an additional 300 sq. ft. to the existing footprint.
5. The work that is described above is consistent with applicable provisions of the Development Guidelines for Contributing buildings in the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone. Sections 111.A.1 through 111.A.6 and 111.B.1 and 111.B.2 are satisfied as analyzed in the staff report. The proposed gabled roof addition at the southeast corner of the existing house is compatible in mass, scale, form and materials with the existing bungalow style house.
6. A portion of the existing frame addition at the northeast would remain in place in this proposal. The remaining walls would be raised and a new hipped roof and windows added.
7. The above-described portion of the proposed work is not consistent with applicable provisions of the Development Guidelines for Contributing buildings in the Huning Highland Historic Overlay Zone sections 111.A.1, A.3 and A.5 and 111.B.2. This component of the proposed work introduces an architectural element that does not relate to the existing building in mass or shape.
8. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if "The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished".
9. This request partially complies with LUCC Ordinance sections 14-12-8-(B)(1), (B)(2), (B)(4) and (B)(5) as analyzed in the staff report. The proposal to construct the hip roofed architectural element at the northeast corner of the building alters the building and site's

distinguished original qualities or character and does not relate to the existing building in shape or mass.

10. The *Albuquerque/Bernalillo County Comprehensive Plan* contains goals and policies related to Environmental Protections and Heritage Conservation. Section 11.C.5 Historic Resources goal is to protect reuse or enhance significant historic districts and buildings.
11. Section 11.C.9 Community Identity and Urban Design goal is “to preserve and enhance the natural and built characteristics, social, cultural and historical features that identify Albuquerque and Bernalillo County sub-areas as distinct communities and collections of neighborhoods.” Policy b states “In each Community Area, strategic planning, neighborhood planning, development and redevelopment shall be evaluated in light of its relationship to and effect upon (3) Local history, specifically architectural styles and traditions and current and historic significance to Albuquerque.”
12. The proposed alteration partially supports the Historic Resources goal and the Community Identity and Urban Design goal and policy b. If modified as described in the conditions below, the proposed alteration will support these stated goals and policies.
13. Objective 1 of the Huning Highland Sector Development Plan is “to protect and enhance the unique residential character of the area.” The proposed alteration partially supports this objective. If modified as described in Condition 1 below, the proposed alteration will support the goals and policies by protecting the architectural integrity of the historic house and the neighborhood.

**RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 09LUCC-50040/ Project # 1000680 –
(October 14, 2009)**

APPROVAL of 09LUCC-50040/ Project # 1000680, an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration, located 408 Edith SE. This property is more specifically described as Lot 8, Block 18 of the Huning Highland Addition, in the Huning Highland Overlay Zone, zoned SU-2/MR, based on the above 13 Findings and subject to the following Conditions:

**Conditions of Approval Recommended for Case # 09LUCC-50040/
Project # 1000680 (October 14, 2009)**

1. The remodeling of the existing and proposed dining room at the northeast corner of the house shall include a gable roof rather than a hipped roof. Revised design is subject to staff review and approval.

2. The windows on the new work may be one over one wood sash windows.
 3. The applicant is to comply with all other relevant City of Albuquerque permits, policies.
-

Maryellen Hennessy, Senior Planner
Current Planning Division

Attachments:

CITY OF ALBUQUERQUE AGENCY COMMENTS

ZONING CODE SERVICES DIVISION

No comment

BUILDING & SAFETY SERVICES DIVISION

Building permit required

ADVANCED PLANNING

No comment

PNM

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT

SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

FIRE DEPARTMENT/Planning

COMMENTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES, WHEN APPLICABLE:

TRANSIT DEPARTMENT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

PARKS AND GENERAL SERVICES

OPEN SPACE DIVISION

BERNALILLO COUNTY

ALBUQUERQUE FLOOD CONTROL AUTHORITY

ALBUQUERQUE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

MIDDLE RIO GRANDE COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS